

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN JOSE DIVISION

In re Apple & AT&TM Antitrust Litigation NO. C 07-05152 JW

**ORDER BIFURCATING CLASS AND
MERITS DISCOVERY; SCHEDULING
CASE MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE**

Presently before the Court are the parties' Proposed Discovery Plans.¹ Plaintiffs contend that simultaneous class and merits discovery is appropriate, while Defendant Apple contends that class discovery should precede merits discovery.


Discovery in a putative class action is generally limited to certification issues in the precertification stage. Babbitt v. Albertain's Inc., 1992 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 19091 at *6 (N.D. Cal. Dec. 1, 1992) (citing Oppenheimer Fund, Inc. v. Sanders, 437 U.S. 340, 359 (1978)). "Discovery on the merits is usually deferred until it is certain that the case will be allowed to proceed as a class action." Id. at *7 (citing Eisen v. Carlisle & Jacqelin, 417 U.S. 156, 177 (1974)).

In this case, the Court finds that bifurcation of class and merits discovery is in the best interest of the efficient resolution of this complex antitrust litigation. Accordingly, the parties are ordered to proceed with class discovery and merits discovery is STAYED.

¹ (Plaintiffs' Proposed Discovery Plan, Docket Item No. 140; Defendant Apple, Inc.'s Proposed Discovery Plan, Docket Item No. 141.)

Further, the parties are ordered to meet and confer and formulate a reasonable class discovery plan. The Court sets a Case Management Conference on **January 12, 2009 at 10:00 a.m.** On or before **January 5, 2009**, the parties shall file a Joint Case Management Statement which shall include the parties' proposed class discovery schedule.

Dated: December 12, 2008



JAMES WARE
United States District Judge

1 THIS IS TO CERTIFY THAT COPIES OF THIS ORDER HAVE BEEN DELIVERED TO:

2 Adrian Frank Davis adrian.davis@lw.com
Alexander H. Schmidt schmidt@whafh.com
3 Alfred Carroll Pfeiffer Al.Pfeiffer@lw.com
Archis Ashok Parasharami aparasharami@mayerbrown.com
4 Arthur William Lazear awl@hoffmanandlazear.com
Christopher E Ondeck condeck@crowell.com
5 Christopher S. Yates chris.yates@lw.com
Damian Rene Fernandez damianfernandez@gmail.com
6 Daniel Allen Sasse dsasse@crowell.com
Daniel Murray Wall dan.wall@lw.com
7 David Eldon Crowe dcrowe@crowell.com
Donald M. Falk dfalk@mayerbrown.com
8 Francis M. Gregorek gregorek@whafh.com
H. Tim Hoffman hth@hoffmanandlazear.com
9 Jeffrey H. Howard jhoward@crowell.com
M. Van Smith mvsmith@sbcglobal.net
10 Marisa C. Livesay livesay@whafh.com
Mark Carl Rifkin rifkin@whafh.com
11 Max Folkenflik max@fmlaw.net
Morgan Matthew Mack mmm@hoffmanandlazear.com
12 Rachele R. Rickert rickert@whafh.com
Randall Scott Newman rsn@randallnewman.net
13 Sadik Harry Huseny sadik.huseny@lw.com
Stephen DeNittis sdenittis@shabeldenittis.com
14 Wm. Randolph Smith wrsmith@crowell.com

15 Dated: December 12, 2008

Richard W. Wieking, Clerk

17 By: /s/ JW Chambers
Elizabeth Garcia
Courtroom Deputy